July 18, 2012

Chairman Julius Genachowski
Federal Communications Commission
445 12th Street SW
Washington, DC 20554

Re: Letter, CG Docket No. 09-158, CC Docket No. 98-170, WC Docket No. 04-36

Dear Chairman Genachowski,

Open data and an independent, transparent measurement framework must be the cornerstones of any scientifically credible broadband Internet access measurement program. The undersigned members of the academic and research communities therefore respectfully ask the Commission to remain committed to the principles of openness and transparency and to allow the scientific process to serve as the foundation of the broadband measurement program.

Measuring network performance is complex. Even among those of us who focus on this topic as our life’s work, there are disagreements. The scientific process happens best in the sunlight and that can only happen when as many eyes as possible are able to look at a shared set of data, work to replicate results, and assess its meaning and impact. This ensures the conclusions from the broadband measurement allow for meaningful, data-driven policy making.

Since the inception of the broadband measurement program, those of us who work on Internet research have lauded its precedent-setting commitment to open-data and transparency. Many of us have engaged with this program, advising on network transparency and measurement methodology and using the openly-released raw data as a part of our research.

However, we understand that some participants in the program have proposed significant changes that would transform an open measurement process into a closed one. Specifically, that the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) is considering a proposal to replace the Measurement Lab server infrastructure with closed infrastructure, run by the participating Internet service providers (ISPs) whose own speeds are being measured.

In order for the scientific process to work, measurement data must be openly available as well as access to methodologies, and explicit cataloging of assumptions is essential if results are to be confirmed and replicated. A switch from an open to a closed infrastructure makes this process impossible or, at best, questionable.

We strongly oppose any decision by the FCC to run a closed measurement program. We urge the managers of the program to reconsider any steps to run measurement tests over closed infrastructure. If expansion of the current infrastructure is needed, those wishing to provision measurement servers should be encouraged to contribute resources to the Measurement Lab Consortium. Measurement Lab is a research network, and operates its servers in a consistent, openly documented manner. This ensures comparable, credible data, and enables the research community to put our faith in the measurement results, and to stake our professional reputations.
on conclusions based on the data.

Respectfully submitted,

Sascha Meinrath
Vice President and Director
Open Technology Institute
New America Foundation

Vint Cerf
Internet Pioneer
Chief Internet Evangelist
Google

Robert W. Taylor
Founder
ARPAnet
Recipient of The National Medal of Technology and The National Academy of Engineering Draper Prize

Board of Directors
Association of Developers and Users of Free Software for Administrations and Local Authorities (ADULLACT)

John Vittal
COO
BalanceTek Corporation
Developer of first full email client (MSG) and email standards (RFC733)

Susan Crawford
Professor
Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law

Scott Shenker
Professor of Computer Science
Berkeley

Ronald Deibert
Director
The Citizen Lab
and The Canada Centre for Global Security Studies
University of Toronto

David J. Farber
Distinguished Career Professor of Computer Science and Public Policy
Carnegie Mellon
Former Chief Technologist
Federal Communications Commission

Rahul Tongia
Adjunct Professor
Carnegie Mellon

George Manley
Storage Engineer
Clemson University

Esther Dyson
Founder
EDventure

Rollie Cole, Ph.D., J.D.
Founder
Fertile Ground for Startups and Small Firms

Gene Gaines
Founder
Gaines Group Consulting

Eric Burger
Director
Center for Secure Communications
Research Professor
Computer Science
Georgetown University
Ellen Witte Zegura  
Professor and Chair  
School of Computer Science  
College of Computing  
Georgia Institute of Technology

Nick Feamster  
Associate Professor  
College of Computing  
Georgia Institute of Technology

Russell Clark  
Research Scientist  
College of Computing and Computer Science  
Georgia Institute of Technology

Matt Welsh  
Staff Software Engineer  
Google

Margo Seltzer  
Herchel Smith Professor of Computer Science  
Harvard College Professor in the School of Engineering and Applied Sciences  
Harvard University

Harry R. Lewis  
Gordon McKay Professor of Computer Science  
Harvard University

David Weinberger  
Senior Researcher  
Harvard Berkman Center for Internet and Society

George Sadowsky  
Chair of the Nominating Committee at Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)  
Internet Pioneer

Mark Allman  
Computer Scientist  
The International Computer Science Institute

Paul Vixie  
Chairman and Founder  
Internet Systems Consortium

The Internet Systems Consortium (ISC)

Dan Lynch  
Founder  
INTEROP  
Internet Pioneer

Hari Balakrishnan  
Fujitsu Professor of Computer Science  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Eric von Hippel  
Professor  
Engineering Systems Division  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Cliff Bamford  
Principal Architect, Internet Operations  
Microsoft (retired)

Brough Turner  
Founder and CTO  
netBlazr, Inc.

Neil Hunt  
Chief Product Officer  
Netflix
Dan McDonald
Senior Engineer
Nexenta Systems

Andrew W. Appel
Department Chair
Eugene Higgins Professor
of Computer Science
Princeton University

Margaret Martonosi
Professor
Department of Computer Science
Princeton University

Gene Spafford
Professor
Department of Computer Science
Purdue University

Barbara van Schewick
Associate Professor of Law
and (by courtesy) Electrical Engineering
Stanford University

Nick McKeown
Professor of Electrical Engineering
and Computer Science
Stanford University

Harold Burstyn
Adjunct Professor
L. C. Smith College of Engineering
and Computer Science
Syracuse University

Roger Bohn
Professor of Management
Director of the Global Information
Information
Industry Center
University of California, San Diego

Fabian Bustamante
Associate Professor
Electrical Engineering and Computer Science
Northwestern University

Jennifer Rexford
Gordon Y. S. Wu Professor in Engineering
Princeton University

Mike Freedman
Assistant Professor
of Computer Science
Princeton University

Marvin Ammori
Affiliate Scholar
Stanford Law School Center for
Internet & Society

Guru Parulkar
Executive Director
Department of Computer Science
Stanford University

Milton Meuller
Professor
School of Information Studies
Syracuse University

Ermanno Pietrosemoli
Telecommunications Professor
(emeritus)
Universidad de los Andes

Sandra Keegan
Ph.D. Researcher
University of Edinburgh Law School
Peter Honeyman  
Research Professor  
of Computer Science and Engineering  
University of Michigan

Steven Huter  
Director  
Network Startup Resource Center  
University of Oregon

Henry M. Levy  
Wissner-Slivka Chair  
in Computer Science and Engineering  
University of Washington

Edward D. Lazowska  
Bill and Melinda Gates Chair  
in Computer Science and Engineering  
University of Washington

Tom Anderson  
Robert E. Dinning Professor  
of Computer Science and Engineering  
University of Washington

Steven D. Gribble  
Professor of Computer Science  
and Engineering  
University of Washington

David J. Wetherall  
Professor of Computer Science  
and Engineering  
University of Washington

John Zahorjan  
Professor of Computer Science  
and Engineering  
University of Washington

Arvind Krishnamurthy  
Associate Professor of Computer Science  
and Engineering  
University of Washington

Seth Woodworth  
Internet Researcher and  
Digital Freedom Advocate

Cc:  Commissioner Mignon Clyburn  
Commissioner Robert M. McDowell  
Commissioner Ajit Pai  
Commissioner Jessica Rosenworcel